

**DIALOGUING IN THE DESERT FOR  
SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT**

**AMBIVALENCE, HYBRIDITY AND  
REPRESENTATIONS OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLE**

**NATALIE McGRATH**

**This thesis is presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at  
Murdoch University 2007**

I declare that this thesis is my own account of my research and contains as its main content work which has not previously been submitted for a degree at any tertiary education institution.

.....

Natalie McGrath

# Table of Contents

<b>ABSTRACT .....</b>	<b>I</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....</b>	<b>V</b>
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS.....</b>	<b>VII</b>
<b>LIST OF FIGURES .....</b>	<b>X</b>
<b>LIST OF TABLES .....</b>	<b>XI</b>
<b>CHAPTER ONE</b>	
<b>INDIGENOUS SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN AN AGE OF AMBIVALENCE .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1.1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1.2 CONCEPTUAL BACKGROUND .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<i>1.2.1 The Ambivalence of Sustainable Development .....</i>	<i>4</i>
<i>1.2.2 The Ambivalence of Modernity .....</i>	<i>8</i>
<i>1.2.3 Representation and Hybridity .....</i>	<i>15</i>
<i>1.2.4 Indigenous Sustainable Development .....</i>	<i>18</i>
<b>1.3 RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS .....</b>	<b>20</b>
<i>1.3.1 Research Questions .....</i>	<i>20</i>
<i>1.3.2 Structure of the Thesis .....</i>	<i>22</i>
<b>1.4 MY PERSONAL HISTORICAL POSITION .....</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>CHAPTER TWO</b>	
<b>REFLECTING UPON METHODOLOGY: DIALOGUING IN THE DESERT .....</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>2.1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>2.2 PHRONETIC RESEARCH: A CASE STUDY APPROACH .....</b>	<b>28</b>
<i>2.2.1 A Case Study Approach .....</i>	<i>30</i>
<i>2.2.2 An Overview of the Case Study .....</i>	<i>34</i>
<b>2.3 DECOLONISING RESEARCH THROUGH PARTICIPATION AND REFLECTIVE NARRATIVE .....</b>	<b>43</b>
<i>2.3.1 Participatory Action Research .....</i>	<i>44</i>
<i>2.3.2 Reflective Practice and Self-Reflexivity: Story Telling .....</i>	<i>45</i>
<i>2.3.3 Interviews .....</i>	<i>48</i>
<i>2.3.4 A Summary of Thesis Stages and Methods .....</i>	<i>50</i>
<i>2.3.5 Ethics .....</i>	<i>51</i>
<i>2.3.6 Validity, Reliability and Objectivity .....</i>	<i>52</i>
<b>2.4 REFLECTING UPON STORIES: A PLURAL-DIMENSIONAL NARRATIVE .....</b>	<b>54</b>
<i>2.4.1 Fieldwork Stage 1 and 2 .....</i>	<i>54</i>
<i>2.4.2 Reflections upon Stage 1 and 2 .....</i>	<i>67</i>
<i>2.4.3 Fieldwork Stage 3 .....</i>	<i>68</i>
<i>2.4.4 Reflections upon Stage 3 .....</i>	<i>75</i>
<i>2.4.5 Reflections upon Fieldwork Stage 4 .....</i>	<i>76</i>
<i>2.4.6 Final Reflections .....</i>	<i>77</i>
<b>CHAPTER THREE</b>	
<b>STORYLINES AND DISCOURSE: THE AUSTRALIAN CONTEXT .....</b>	<b>79</b>
<b>3.1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>79</b>
<b>3.2 STORYLINES AND DISCOURSE .....</b>	<b>80</b>
<b>3.3 A BRIEF HISTORY OF AUSTRALIAN POLICY .....</b>	<b>82</b>
<b>3.4 TWO STORYLINES OF INDIGENOUS SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT .....</b>	<b>87</b>
<b>3.5 DISCOURSE ABOUT INDIGENOUS PEOPLE IN AUSTRALIA .....</b>	<b>91</b>
<b>3.6 DISCUSSION .....</b>	<b>110</b>

<b>CHAPTER FOUR</b>	
<b>AMBIVALENT STORIES: POWER AND REPRESENTATION .....</b>	<b>119</b>
<b>4.1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>119</b>
<b>4.2 THEORIES OF POWER .....</b>	<b>119</b>
<b>4.3 DISCOURSE ABOUT MARTU PEOPLE .....</b>	<b>122</b>
<b>4.4 THEMES FOR DISCUSSION .....</b>	<b>153</b>
<i>4.4.1 Discourse and the Power of Storylines .....</i>	<i>154</i>
<i>4.4.2 Regional Narratives: Sustaining Development? .....</i>	<i>160</i>
<i>4.4.3 Power and Knowledge in the Consultancy Participatory Projects .....</i>	<i>171</i>
<i>4.4.4 Representation in the Consultancy Participatory projects .....</i>	<i>178</i>
<i>4.4.5 Insiders and/or Outsiders .....</i>	<i>180</i>
<b>4.5 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>186</b>
<b>CHAPTER FIVE</b>	
<b>HYBRID SPACES: CULTURE, REPRESENTATION AND THE POLITICS OF</b>	
<b>DIFFERENCE.....</b>	<b>189</b>
<b>5.1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>189</b>
<b>5.2 MARTU CULTURAL CHANGE.....</b>	<b>189</b>
<b>5.3 CULTURAL DIFFERENCE.....</b>	<b>195</b>
<b>5.4 GENDER .....</b>	<b>201</b>
<i>5.4.1 Historical Representations of Indigenous Gender in Australia .....</i>	<i>202</i>
<i>5.4.2 Gender and Martu Participation in the Consultancy Participatory Projects.....</i>	<i>204</i>
<i>5.4.3 Reflections upon Representation .....</i>	<i>208</i>
<b>5.5 COMMUNITY AND THE POLITICS OF DIFFERENCE.....</b>	<b>211</b>
<i>5.5.1 Community.....</i>	<i>212</i>
<i>5.5.2 Individual.....</i>	<i>216</i>
<i>5.5.3 Family.....</i>	<i>218</i>
<i>5.5.4 Community Leaders.....</i>	<i>222</i>
<i>5.5.5 Reflections upon Representation .....</i>	<i>226</i>
<b>5.6 DISCUSSION .....</b>	<b>228</b>
<i>5.6.1 Difference and Hybridity .....</i>	<i>228</i>
<i>5.6.2 Politics.....</i>	<i>232</i>
<i>5.6.3 Cross-cultural Communication.....</i>	<i>236</i>
<b>5.7 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>242</b>
<b>CHAPTER SIX</b>	
<b>AMBIVALENCE AND HYBRIDITY: LESSONS OF HOPE FOR SUSTAINABLE</b>	
<b>DEVELOPMENT .....</b>	<b>247</b>
<b>6.1 INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>247</b>
<b>6.2 RELATIONSHIPS AND REPRESENTATION .....</b>	<b>248</b>
<i>6.2.1 Relationships across Culture in the Western Desert .....</i>	<i>248</i>
<i>6.2.2 Relational Holism .....</i>	<i>255</i>
<b>6.3 POWER, POLITICS AND DELIBERATIVE DEMOCRACY .....</b>	<b>262</b>
<i>6.3.1 Power and Politics.....</i>	<i>263</i>
<i>6.3.2 Cosmopolitan Deliberative Democracy.....</i>	<i>265</i>
<b>6.4 CROSS-CULTURAL GOVERNANCE .....</b>	<b>268</b>
<i>6.4.1 Cross-cultural Governance in Australia.....</i>	<i>269</i>
<i>6.4.2 Institutional Change .....</i>	<i>281</i>
<b>6.5 REFRAMING DEVELOPMENT THROUGH CULTURE VALUE CHALLENGE .....</b>	<b>288</b>
<i>6.5.1 Development and Hybrid Modernities .....</i>	<i>289</i>
<i>6.5.2 Autonomy, Choice and Capabilities .....</i>	<i>293</i>
<b>6.6 CONCLUSION .....</b>	<b>298</b>
<b>CHAPTER SEVEN</b>	
<b>SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND FURTHER RESEARCH .....</b>	<b>301</b>
<b>7.1 REVISITING THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS .....</b>	<b>301</b>
<b>7.2 THESIS SUMMARY .....</b>	<b>301</b>

7.2.1 Research Question One .....	302
7.2.2 Research Question Two .....	309
7.3 THESIS CONCLUSIONS .....	311
7.4 AREAS OF FURTHER RESEARCH.....	315
<b>APPENDIX ONE TENSIONS OF SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT.....</b>	<b>317</b>
<b>APPENDIX TWO NEWSPAPER ARTICLE ABOUT ALCOHOL.....</b>	<b>329</b>
<b>APPENDIX THREE NEWMAN ABORIGINAL EDUCATION PARTNERSHIP ARTICLE .....</b>	<b>331</b>
<b>APPENDIX FOUR NEWSPAPER PAPER ARTICLE ABOUT THE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT AT PARNPAJINYA .....</b>	<b>333</b>
<b>APPENDIX FIVE ADVERTISING FOR THE MARTU COUNCIL'S AGM.....</b>	<b>335</b>
<b>APPENDIX SIX TRAINING NOTES FOR THE MARTU COUNCIL ABOUT PROTOCOLS FOR MEETINGS.....</b>	<b>337</b>
<b>APPENDIX SEVEN NEWSPAPER ARTICLE ABOUT BASKET MAKING .....</b>	<b>339</b>
<b>REFERENCES.....</b>	<b>341</b>

Para tener acceso completo a este libro usted debe solicitarlo de manera formal a la Coordinación del Programa de Doctorado Interinstitucional en Ciencias Ambientales mediante el **Formato de Préstamo Bibliográfico** ([descargar formato](#)) y remitirlo al siguiente correo: **[dicambientales@unicauca.edu.co](mailto:dicambientales@unicauca.edu.co)**



DOCTORADO INTERINSTITUCIONAL EN  
CIENCIAS AMBIENTALES

